

1

00:00:00,000 --> 00:00:05,730

Judson Murray received his BA summa cum laude and "with distinction" in religious

2

00:00:05,730 --> 00:00:12,480

studies from The Ohio State University. He holds an M.T.S. from Harvard Divinity

3

00:00:12,480 --> 00:00:18,630

School and was awarded the John and Ineke Carmen Scholarship from the Center

4

00:00:18,630 --> 00:00:23,970

for the Study of World Religions at Harvard University. His PhD is from

5

00:00:23,970 --> 00:00:28,859

Brown's Department of Religious Studies. While completing his doctorate he was

6

00:00:28,859 --> 00:00:34,110

awarded a Charlotte W. Newcombe Doctoral Dissertation Fellowship from the Woodrow

7

00:00:34,110 --> 00:00:39,000

Wilson Foundation. He teaches a wide array of courses on East Asian religions

8

00:00:39,000 --> 00:00:44,600

and in 2013 he was the recipient of the honors Teacher of the Year award.

9

00:00:44,600 --> 00:00:50,370

Murray's principal areas of research include Chinese religions and early

10

00:00:50,370 --> 00:00:56,730

Chinese intellectual history. His talk is titled "Debating Meditation and Education

11

00:00:56,730 --> 00:01:04,199

in Confucian Moral Self-Cultivation". So most of I think we associate meditation

12

00:01:04,199 --> 00:01:09,030

with Buddhism or Daoism but there is meditative practice that happens in

13

00:01:09,030 --> 00:01:14,040

Confucianism and there's lots of debates about the value and purpose of it and my

14

00:01:14,040 --> 00:01:17,040

paper is going to explore a bit of that and just to keep you on task I'm going

15

00:01:17,040 --> 00:01:21,810

to read some prepared remarks and then hopefully show some images that will

16

00:01:21,810 --> 00:01:26,670

make a little bit of this more alive to you all. So my book project examines

17

00:01:26,670 --> 00:01:31,409

different variations on a long-standing debate and Confucianism concerning how

18

00:01:31,409 --> 00:01:35,640

best to develop people morally.

Confucians from different eras of the

19

00:01:35,640 --> 00:01:39,000

traditions history have disagreed on the nature of the approach and here it's ought

20

00:01:39,000 --> 00:01:43,259

to employ in their regimen of personal and moral self-cultivation, specifically

21

00:01:43,259 --> 00:01:46,649

whether it should mainly consist of an active and engaged course of moral

22

00:01:46,649 --> 00:01:51,420

education or a more passive and contemplative form of training utilizing

23

00:01:51,420 --> 00:01:55,920

meditation. Today I will examine several aspects of one particular version of

24

00:01:55,920 --> 00:02:00,360

this debate between these competing

approaches that took place in Confucian

25

00:02:00,360 --> 00:02:04,770

circles in both China and Japan during
approximately the seventeenth and

26

00:02:04,770 --> 00:02:08,789

eighteenth centuries. The analysis
focuses on the critical responses of

27

00:02:08,789 --> 00:02:13,240

some Confucians to the inclusion of a
practice called "quiet sitting"

28

00:02:13,240 --> 00:02:18,400

into the Confucian orthopraxy. Both
proponents of its inclusion and those

29

00:02:18,400 --> 00:02:22,570

who oppose this move did not disagree
about the foremost aim of Confucian

30

00:02:22,570 --> 00:02:26,950

moral self-cultivation, namely to develop
and exemplify Ren which is

31

00:02:26,950 --> 00:02:32,370

conventionally translated as humaneness,
and in this etymology, this very graph

32

00:02:32,370 --> 00:02:37,350

is number two the two lines there on the
right that you see and then on the other

33

00:02:37,350 --> 00:02:41,410

side of the character, the radical
for the graph is the character of the

34

00:02:41,410 --> 00:02:45,580

human being. So embedded in this graph
itself is the sense that we are

35

00:02:45,580 --> 00:02:51,640

inherently relational and social beings.

Now at this point in the traditions

36

00:02:51,640 --> 00:02:55,870

history Ren was understood to mean
forming a genuine unity between oneself

37

00:02:55,870 --> 00:03:00,970

and all the people and things in
happening the world. In other words, it

38

00:03:00,970 --> 00:03:04,780

entails a profound empathetic more
responsiveness to the people things at

39

00:03:04,780 --> 00:03:09,250

events we encounter every day based on
an assumed continuity of being among all

40

00:03:09,250 --> 00:03:14,440

forms of life and their interrelation
and interdependence in fashioning a world in which each and

41

00:03:14,440 --> 00:03:18,880

all flourish. Although these confusions
agreed on this ethical aim, they differed

42

00:03:18,880 --> 00:03:22,300

significantly on the optimal method of
moral cultivation that enables people to

43

00:03:22,300 --> 00:03:27,160

exemplify it. First, allow me to outline
the contemplative approach under

44

00:03:27,160 --> 00:03:30,910

scrutiny and several of the assumptions
and objectives associated with this

45

00:03:30,910 --> 00:03:36,580

approach that critics rejected. What type
of meditative practice does quiet

46

00:03:36,580 --> 00:03:41,380

sitting entail? Proponents of quiet
sitting while influenced by different

47

00:03:41,380 --> 00:03:48,780

Daoist and Buddhist contemplative approaches were keen to distinguish their approach from these
others that had a longer history of use and elaboration

48

00:03:48,900 --> 00:03:54,280

in East Asia. Unlike Daoist
visualizations or Buddhist meditative

49

00:03:54,280 --> 00:03:58,450

techniques or co on training for
example, confusion quiet sitting was much

50

00:03:58,450 --> 00:04:03,100

less formalized. Basically quiet sitting
consisted of sitting somewhere quiet and

51

00:04:03,100 --> 00:04:07,900

solitude for unspecified duration of
time. Unlike Buddhists who recommended

52

00:04:07,900 --> 00:04:11,380

sitting in the lotus position and who
often employed different breathing

53

00:04:11,380 --> 00:04:15,070

techniques, Confucians conveyed little to

no concrete instructions to its

54

00:04:15,070 --> 00:04:19,810

practitioners concerning their posture
over their breathing. Reciting certain

55

00:04:19,810 --> 00:04:23,530

classical Confucian moral teachings as a
kind of mantra, was sometimes

56

00:04:23,530 --> 00:04:25,910

recommended to put practitioners in the
right frame of

57

00:04:25,910 --> 00:04:31,100

mind. Also practitioners admitted that
quiet sitting needed needed to be

58

00:04:31,100 --> 00:04:34,910

performed diligently and for a long
period of time in order for it to have a

59

00:04:34,910 --> 00:04:41,030

transformative and lasting impact on
them. Now it's more relaxed and freeform

60

00:04:41,030 --> 00:04:45,230

nature was meant to guard against two
possible undesirable outcomes. First,

61

00:04:45,230 --> 00:04:48,740

there was a concern that too much
structure could degenerate the practice

62

00:04:48,740 --> 00:04:53,390

into an unwanted quietism that would
undermine the practitioners ability to

63

00:04:53,390 --> 00:04:58,090

engage the world and other people. Second,
proponents acknowledged that

64

00:04:58,090 --> 00:05:04,400

deliberately attempting to quiet the
heart mind by focusing thoughts and

65

00:05:04,400 --> 00:05:08,780

feelings forced by - I'm sorry - by forcing
thoughts and feelings out of it could be

66

00:05:08,780 --> 00:05:12,370

counterproductive to achieving the
desired mental and emotional tranquility.

67

00:05:12,370 --> 00:05:17,500

Fewer constraints allowed the heart-mind
to become quiet on its own accord and

68

00:05:17,500 --> 00:05:22,940

for both the Chinese and the Japanese
they really only have one character for

69

00:05:22,940 --> 00:05:27,920

the heart and the mind and Chinese its
Xin and in Japanese its Kokoro and so

70

00:05:27,920 --> 00:05:30,980

there's not this sort of distinction
drawn in lots of Western philosophical

71

00:05:30,980 --> 00:05:31,480

traditions between a mind-body
distinction. Thinking and feeling happen

72

00:05:34,550 --> 00:05:39,800

in the xin simultaneously. A survey of
Confucian opinions on what quiet

73

00:05:39,800 --> 00:05:43,280

sitting can accomplish reveals a wide
array of goal - a wide array of goals

74

00:05:43,280 --> 00:05:47,630

from the more mundane to the surpassingly transformative. Examples of

75

00:05:47,630 --> 00:05:53,770

the former include alleviating anxieties,
improving memory, enhancing concentration,

76

00:05:53,770 --> 00:05:58,880

eliminating idle thoughts, limiting
external distractions, cognizance of both

77

00:05:58,880 --> 00:06:03,680

emotional thoughts and impulses associated
with the body, cultivating correct moral

78

00:06:03,680 --> 00:06:07,940

thoughts and developing composure and
calm purposefulness. All of which [is]

79

00:06:07,940 --> 00:06:10,910

people in fulfilling the personal and
professional duties required of their

80

00:06:10,910 --> 00:06:14,770

everyday relations and affairs. Quiet
sitting also [forwards] practitioners

81

00:06:14,770 --> 00:06:19,690

recuperative moments of peace and rest
after those daily demands have been met.

82

00:06:19,690 --> 00:06:24,530

Had its supporters stopped there, perhaps
critics would have viewed it as one relatively

83

00:06:24,530 --> 00:06:29,960

harmless component of a broader program
of moral education. However proponents

84

00:06:29,960 --> 00:06:33,380

sought more ambitious cognitive and
ethical goals by practicing quiet

85

00:06:33,380 --> 00:06:37,520

sitting and claim to accomplish much
grander achievements because of it.

86

00:06:37,520 --> 00:06:41,840

For instance, they claim the practice
enabled them to probe and understand

87

00:06:41,840 --> 00:06:47,750

fully the depths and original substance
of human nature and to observe inner

88

00:06:47,750 --> 00:06:52,520

emotions in there emergent unmanifest

state which allowed practitioners to

89

00:06:52,520 --> 00:06:56,419

curtail or properly channel these
emotions and thereby limiting untoward

90

00:06:56,419 --> 00:07:01,639

in an excessive emotional outbursts. Most
notably they asserted quiet sitting aids

91

00:07:01,639 --> 00:07:05,120

in calming the ceaseless flow of
cognitive and affective activities

92

00:07:05,120 --> 00:07:08,690

associated with consciousness.
Particularly those thoughts and feelings

93

00:07:08,690 --> 00:07:13,520

contaminated by subjective biases and
selfish desires that are distortive

94

00:07:13,520 --> 00:07:18,860

obstacles to understanding things and events as they really are. Confusions of

95

00:07:18,860 --> 00:07:23,949

the age conceptualize objective reality in terms of the Chinese character "li"

96

00:07:23,949 --> 00:07:29,419

which is conventionally translated as principal. Originally this graph

97

00:07:29,419 --> 00:07:34,180

designated the pattern of colored [vades] found in Jade as these images illustrate,

98

00:07:34,180 --> 00:07:39,139

but it came to signify the distinctive Constitution and functioning [each single]

99

00:07:39,139 --> 00:07:43,789

event naturally has and does as well as the totality of the different principles

100

00:07:43,789 --> 00:07:48,139

that make up the order and structure of
the entire cosmos. For example, Confucians

101

00:07:48,139 --> 00:07:51,770

theorized that the principle of four -
of the Four Seasons is their fixed

102

00:07:51,770 --> 00:07:56,210

sequence that of government is to
provide order and well-being for the

103

00:07:56,210 --> 00:08:01,310

people and whereas animals merely live
and reproduce ,the li of people is that

104

00:08:01,310 --> 00:08:07,039

they're moral. Proponents argued that the
mental and emotional quietude attained

105

00:08:07,039 --> 00:08:11,360

through quiet sitting enhances the
sensory, cognitive, and moral acuity of

106

00:08:11,360 --> 00:08:15,080

those who practice it and allows them to discern accurately the different

107

00:08:15,080 --> 00:08:18,860

principles they encounter and any discrete circumstance in the same clear

108

00:08:18,860 --> 00:08:23,090

and objective way that mirrors and still water reflect the objects placed

109

00:08:23,090 --> 00:08:27,740

before them. Training the heart-mind in this way occasions an effortless and

110

00:08:27,740 --> 00:08:32,089

unerring empathetic resonance with and responsiveness to people, things, and

111

00:08:32,089 --> 00:08:36,979

events that manifests in one's conduct. As now, one is assured of knowing what

112

00:08:36,979 --> 00:08:41,149

should be done morally based on a
mirror-like understanding of what is so.

113

00:08:41,149 --> 00:08:46,910

This spontaneous correspondence between
is and ought between fact and value in

114

00:08:46,910 --> 00:08:50,449

performing our moral duties, in resolving
moral dilemmas, and in deciding on

115

00:08:50,449 --> 00:08:53,830

suitable courses
of action is one key way Ren was

116

00:08:53,830 --> 00:08:58,240

conceived as forming a unity with heaven
and earth and all things. Critics of

117

00:08:58,240 --> 00:09:04,090

quiet sitting rejected this attempt to

have the heart-mind resemble the

118

00:09:04,090 --> 00:09:09,070

qualities of a mirror or still water -

excuse me - arguing that doing so would be

119

00:09:09,070 --> 00:09:13,240

unnatural, too passive and therefore

morally ineffective and by asserting

120

00:09:13,240 --> 00:09:17,890

that the practice is elitist. They began

by discrediting the metaphors used to

121

00:09:17,890 --> 00:09:22,000

exemplify the goal. One Chinese critic

pointed out that the reflections of

122

00:09:22,000 --> 00:09:26,860

flowers in a mirror or the moon on still

water are not real. The flowers can't be

123

00:09:26,860 --> 00:09:30,450

plucked or smelled for their fragrance,
and the moon illuminates nothing at all.

124

00:09:30,450 --> 00:09:34,990

These images and the theoretical
extractions they signified were empty,

125

00:09:34,990 --> 00:09:40,030

useless, and therefore unhelpful in
developing people morally. Furthermore on

126

00:09:40,030 --> 00:09:46,030

still waters placidity, a contested point
in this debate concerned where the

127

00:09:46,030 --> 00:09:50,440

stillness or movement is humankind's
optimal natural state. Critics disagreed

128

00:09:50,440 --> 00:09:54,850

that quiescence is the heart-minds
optimal natural condition. If anything, it is

129

00:09:54,850 --> 00:09:59,680

unnatural. They argued that water's quintessential nature is its ceaseless

130

00:09:59,680 --> 00:10:05,770

fluidity and flow, not its placidity and the motion and action to find all life

131

00:10:05,770 --> 00:10:09,700

forms in existence itself and different thinkers observe this about not just

132

00:10:09,700 --> 00:10:14,260

water but flora and fauna and human existence. For instance, one critic

133

00:10:14,260 --> 00:10:18,430

asserted that endeavouring to make the heart-mind still in blank, severs the

134

00:10:18,430 --> 00:10:23,080

heart-mind from its natural feelings of compassion and rightness and thereby

135

00:10:23,080 --> 00:10:27,910

erodes humanities moral nature. If people
quiet their natural feelings and desires,

136

00:10:27,910 --> 00:10:33,220

they actually become vacuous and
lifeless internally, which transforms

137

00:10:33,220 --> 00:10:37,000

them into something less than genuinely
human. So instead of comparing them to

138

00:10:37,000 --> 00:10:42,670

water, critics like in the heart-mind in
this condition to withered wood and dead

139

00:10:42,670 --> 00:10:47,290

ashes. Another Chinese critic argued that
rather than facilitating the ethical

140

00:10:47,290 --> 00:10:51,640

ideal of forming a unity with all things,
quiet sitting actually isolates the self

141

00:10:51,640 --> 00:10:56,230

both physically and morally from all
that lies outside it. The problem is

142

00:10:56,230 --> 00:10:59,710

quiet sitting can too easily reify one
sense of self to the point that a

143

00:10:59,710 --> 00:11:05,720

self-interested partiality emerges, which
ironically is the very thing to practice

144

00:11:05,720 --> 00:11:07,930

[tries] to overcome to reach unity. Moreover this

145

00:11:07,930 --> 00:11:11,320

biased perspective and because so much
emphasis is placed on the practitioners

146

00:11:11,320 --> 00:11:15,910

inner life, causes the unnatural in
Confucian terms outcome of neglect

147

00:11:15,910 --> 00:11:20,290

fulness on the practitioners part
concerning the external world. A Japanese

148

00:11:20,290 --> 00:11:24,010

critic who had experimented with quiet
sitting in the past complained that his

149

00:11:24,010 --> 00:11:28,510

experience with it not only made him
grave and withdrawn, but also distracted

150

00:11:28,510 --> 00:11:32,860

him from fulfilling his daily
responsibilities. Another contested point

151

00:11:32,860 --> 00:11:36,610

concerned identifying the activities
that were most conducive to enacting Ren

152

00:11:36,610 --> 00:11:41,350

in one day - in one's daily life. Recalled

the proponents of quiet sitting claimed

153

00:11:41,350 --> 00:11:45,430

the practice enabled people to draw on
the mental and emotional quiescence and

154

00:11:45,430 --> 00:11:50,080

the heightened clarity they cultivated
through it and respond to the principles

155

00:11:50,080 --> 00:11:54,370

of things and events they encountered in
the optimal moral way. Critics were

156

00:11:54,370 --> 00:11:58,630

dubious about the moral and practical
serviceability of a perception of

157

00:11:58,630 --> 00:12:03,279

non-duality achieved through meditation
because of the short duration of such an

158

00:12:03,279 --> 00:12:07,540

experience and because it was far too abstract and passive an approach. They

159

00:12:07,540 --> 00:12:10,600

argued there were more meaningful and more effective activities that ought to

160

00:12:10,600 --> 00:12:14,500

replace quiet sitting which included everyday activities such as farming,

161

00:12:14,500 --> 00:12:18,640

weaving, and craftsmen's work that contributed materially to the common

162

00:12:18,640 --> 00:12:22,810

good. Critics complained that practitioners of quiet sitting were too

163

00:12:22,810 --> 00:12:26,550

preoccupied with abstract speculation about the mind and human nature and

164

00:12:26,550 --> 00:12:32,200

compared them to women who are the laughingstock of soldiers and craftsmen

165

00:12:32,200 --> 00:12:36,640

and farmers. Critics contended that the people best suited to the task of moral

166

00:12:36,640 --> 00:12:40,660

cultivation are the average and lowborn, not the socio-economic and political

167

00:12:40,660 --> 00:12:45,100

elite. In contrast to the latter's privileged in pampered lives of the

168

00:12:45,100 --> 00:12:48,850

bound with sensual material gratification, the lower classes are

169

00:12:48,850 --> 00:12:52,660

taught in the school of hardship which avails to them a kind of practical

170

00:12:52,660 --> 00:12:58,600

wisdom and efficacy. Moreover critics explain that commoners acutely grasp the

171

00:12:58,600 --> 00:13:02,370

nature of both changing life circumstances and real human emotions.

172

00:13:02,370 --> 00:13:06,940

Unlike commoners who exemplify their genuine humanity and earnest and

173

00:13:06,940 --> 00:13:10,839

productive ways, practitioners of quiet sitting had time to meditate and

174

00:13:10,839 --> 00:13:14,890

theorize because they parasitically lived off the labor of hard-working

175

00:13:14,890 --> 00:13:18,279

common people in a manner amounting to blatant thievery.

176

00:13:18,279 --> 00:13:22,089

Furthermore, proponents of the practice had conceived of their epistemological

177

00:13:22,089 --> 00:13:27,129

and ethical aims in terms that actually glorified the condition of commoners who

178

00:13:27,129 --> 00:13:30,699

have a simpler and more straightforward outlook in manner about them and who

179

00:13:30,699 --> 00:13:35,499

could thereby mirror their world more readily. In truth however, the schoolmen

180

00:13:35,499 --> 00:13:39,670

knew nothing firsthand of the common people's values day-to-day lives and

181

00:13:39,670 --> 00:13:45,999

toil. One thinker I'll mention my name,

Ando Shoeki, conceived of the ethical

182

00:13:45,999 --> 00:13:49,899

unity Ren signifies through what he
poetically termed the way of the living

183

00:13:49,899 --> 00:13:54,670

truth. He defined it cosmologically as
nature's marvelous, spontaneous,

184

00:13:54,670 --> 00:13:59,040

self-generating, and self-sustaining, and
self-acting processes and activities.

185

00:13:59,040 --> 00:14:03,999

Examples include birth, growth, vitality,
subsistence, assistance, protection,

186

00:14:03,999 --> 00:14:09,220

kinship, and love. Two important ways
people participate in and manifest this

187

00:14:09,220 --> 00:14:15,370

dao or way are through the universal
labors of farming and weaving, which as

188

00:14:15,370 --> 00:14:19,089

noted earlier also contribute
significantly to forming their moral

189

00:14:19,089 --> 00:14:23,470

character. Another way they engage in it
relates to both how they process the

190

00:14:23,470 --> 00:14:27,730

grains they grow into food they can eat
and the place and tool they used to do

191

00:14:27,730 --> 00:14:32,559

it. Both the symbol and implement of
humankind's living truth is the home's

192

00:14:32,559 --> 00:14:37,269

hearth, which is the center of the
family's life. Not only its subsistence

193

00:14:37,269 --> 00:14:42,220

and activities but also its cohesion and its love. The hearth provides the family

194

00:14:42,220 --> 00:14:46,029

was shelter from its warmth and with the heat needed to cook the grains family

195

00:14:46,029 --> 00:14:49,569

members will consume to nourish their bodies and thereby perpetuate their own

196

00:14:49,569 --> 00:14:54,339

lives, the family line, and humankind itself. The hearth is also the source of

197

00:14:54,339 --> 00:14:58,449

warmth emotionally, as families from diverse cultures and all ages have

198

00:14:58,449 --> 00:15:03,279

gathered before it in the solidarity born of the mutual love of kinship. It's

199

00:15:03,279 --> 00:15:07,420

where stories are told, laughter and
songs are heard, lessons are taught and

200

00:15:07,420 --> 00:15:13,540

learned, hopes are conveyed, and tears are
shed and consoled. Shoekei explained

201

00:15:13,540 --> 00:15:17,499

that the totality of activities and
experiences of the great multitudes of

202

00:15:17,499 --> 00:15:22,749

people, past, present, and future is
subsumed holographically, within a single

203

00:15:22,749 --> 00:15:27,040

hearth, family, and person, as this
constitutes our shared and unifying

204

00:15:27,040 --> 00:15:31,850

living truth. As the whole is inscribed
in each of its constituent parts,

205

00:15:31,850 --> 00:15:37,160

one farmer unites with and encompasses
all farmers and one hearth unites with and

206

00:15:37,160 --> 00:15:42,319

encompasses all hearths. Through farming in
the hearth that processes what farmers

207

00:15:42,319 --> 00:15:47,029

grow, people succeed in making their own
activities unite with and participate in

208

00:15:47,029 --> 00:15:51,529

those of all other people and
importantly in the same singular living

209

00:15:51,529 --> 00:16:03,880

truth. Namely, the vital process of life
itself. Thank you. Any questions? Yeah, Mark!

210

00:16:03,880 --> 00:16:11,149

Hey Jud, are you able to screen the

shot of the heart-mind character,

211

00:16:11,149 --> 00:16:17,600

and describe that? You told us how Ren works,
well what about the heart-mind and how

212

00:16:17,600 --> 00:16:23,569

that actually - it's actually - you on there -what's interesting about this graph, well first off, it's a pictogram,

213

00:16:23,569 --> 00:16:27,110

it's meant to depict the vows of art.
Sometimes the Chinese very much they

214

00:16:27,110 --> 00:16:30,380

mimicked their characters by making
pictograms of what is they're trying to

215

00:16:30,380 --> 00:16:35,750

convey and so the heart - that this
encompasses both what's here and what's

216

00:16:35,750 --> 00:16:39,319

in here and they only have one character
for it and because the Japanese

217

00:16:39,319 --> 00:16:43,850

inherited so much from the Chinese
language, whereas this is xin in Chinese,

218

00:16:43,850 --> 00:16:50,750

the pronunciation of it is kokoro in the
japanese, and it encompasses this xin, this

219

00:16:50,750 --> 00:16:56,329

sort of holistic, connective, integrative,
mind-body complex accounts for all

220

00:16:56,329 --> 00:17:00,079

aspects of consciousness, our cognitive
functioning, our effective qualities, our

221

00:17:00,079 --> 00:17:06,679

intentions, our moral reasoning, our
judgments, our perception, our emotions

222

00:17:06,679 --> 00:17:12,100

and desires. Both the problematic aspects
of our existence that things like either

223

00:17:12,100 --> 00:17:17,150

farming, weaving, or meditative practice
are meant to correct, but also it

224

00:17:17,150 --> 00:17:23,240

encompasses sort of the highest order of our
the realm or the organs or the

225

00:17:23,240 --> 00:17:27,829

sensibilities that we have that allow
for this kind of moral development and

226

00:17:27,829 --> 00:17:36,409

comes as both.

Thank you.